

BOLOGNA PROCESS STOCKTAKING 2007

Indicators for stocktaking scorecard

BOLOGNA PROCESS STOCKTAKING 2007

List of the indicators for the *Bologna scorecard 2007*

Degree system

1. Stage of implementation of the first and second cycle
2. Access to the next cycle
3. Implementation of national qualifications framework

Quality assurance

4. National implementation of *Standards and Guidelines for QA in the EHEA*
5. Stage of development of external quality assurance system
6. Level of student and international participation

Recognition of degrees and study periods

7. Stage of implementation of diploma supplement
8. National implementation of the principles of the Lisbon Recognition Convention
9. Stage of implementation of ECTS

Lifelong learning

10. Recognition of prior learning

Joint degrees

11. Establishment and recognition of joint degrees

SCORECARD CRITERIA FOR THE DEGREE SYSTEM

1. Stage of implementation of the first and second cycle

DEGREE SYSTEM	1. Stage of implementation of the first and second cycle
Green (5)	In 2006/07 at least 90% of all ¹ students are enrolled in a two-cycle degree system ² that is in accordance with the Bologna principles
Light green (4)	In 2006/07 60-89 % of all students are enrolled in a two-cycle degree system that is in accordance with the Bologna principles
Yellow (3)	In 2006/07 30-59 % of all students are enrolled in a two-cycle degree system that is in accordance with the Bologna principles
Orange (2)	In 2006/07 less than 30 % of all students are enrolled in a two-cycle degree system that is in accordance with the Bologna principles OR Legislation for a degree system in accordance with the Bologna principles has been adopted and is awaiting implementation
Red (1)	No students are enrolled in a two-cycle degree system that is in accordance with the Bologna principles AND there is no legislation in force to make the degree system compatible with the Bologna principles

¹ “All” = all students who could be involved in 2-cycle system i.e. NOT those in doctoral programmes and NOT those in short HE programmes

² There may be exceptions for a limited number fields leading to regulated professions

2. Access to the next cycle

DEGREE SYSTEM	2. Access to the next cycle
Green (5)	All first cycle qualifications give access ³ to several second cycle programmes and all second cycle qualifications give access to at least one third cycle programme without major transitional problems ⁴
Light green (4)	All first cycle qualifications give access to at least one second cycle programme and all second cycle qualifications give access to at least one third cycle programme without major transitional problems
Yellow (3)	There are some (less than 25%) first cycle qualifications that do not give access to the second cycle and/or some second cycle qualifications that do not give access to the third cycle
Orange (2)	A significant number (25 - 50%) of first and/or second cycle qualifications do not give access to the next cycle
Red (1)	Most (more than 50%) first and/or second cycle qualifications do not give access to the next cycle OR there are no arrangements for access to the next cycle

³ Access : the right of qualified candidates to apply and to be considered for admission (definition used in the Lisbon Recognition Convention)

⁴ Compensatory measures required for students coming from another study field will not be counted as “major transitional problems”

3. Implementation of national qualifications framework

DEGREE SYSTEM	3. Implementation of national qualifications framework
Green (5)	A national QF ⁵ in line with the overarching QF for EHEA is in place ⁶
Light green (4)	A proposal for a national QF in line with the overarching QF for EHEA has been discussed with all relevant stakeholders at the national level and a timetable for implementation has been agreed
Yellow (3)	A proposal for a national QF in line with the overarching QF for EHEA has been prepared
Orange (2)	The development process leading to definition of national QF in line with the overarching QF for EHEA has started, and it includes all the relevant national stakeholders
Red (1)	Work at establishing national QF in line with the overarching QF for EHEA has not started

⁵ A qualifications framework designed with a view of meeting the criteria for self-certification with the EHEA overarching framework (outcomes-based, linked to ECTS, linked to cycle descriptors in EHEA framework)

⁶ In some countries, this would mean that the QF is embedded in national legislation; in other countries it would mean that it has been agreed between all the relevant stakeholders and is ready to be implemented

SCORECARD CRITERIA FOR QUALITY ASSURANCE

4. National implementation of *Standards and Guidelines for QA in the EHEA*

QUALITY ASSURANCE	4. National implementation of <i>Standards and Guidelines for QA in the EHEA</i>
Green (5)	A national QA system in line with the <i>Standards and Guidelines for QA in the EHEA</i> is fully operational
Light green (4)	The process of implementing a national QA system in line with the <i>Standards and Guidelines for QA in the EHEA</i> has started
Yellow (3)	There are plans and established deadlines for amending the national QA system in line with the <i>Standards and Guidelines for QA in the EHEA</i>
Orange (2)	National quality assurance system is under review in line with the <i>Standards and Guidelines for QA in the EHEA</i>
Red (1)	No arrangements to implement the <i>Standards and Guidelines for QA in the EHEA</i>

5. Stage of development of external quality assurance system

QUALITY ASSURANCE	5. Stage of development of external quality assurance system
Green (5)	<p>A fully functioning quality assurance system is in operation at national level and applies to all HE⁷</p> <p>Evaluation of programmes or institutions includes three elements:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - internal assessment, - external review, - publication of results. <p>In addition, procedures have been established for peer review of national QA agency(ies) according to the <i>Standards and Guidelines for QA in the EHEA</i></p>
Light green (4)	<p>A Quality Assurance system is in operation at national level and applies to all HE</p> <p>The quality assurance system covers three elements:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> -internal assessment -external review - publication of results, but no procedures are in place for peer review of national QA agency(ies) according to the <i>Standards and Guidelines for QA in the EHEA</i>
Yellow (3)	<p>A Quality Assurance system is in operation at national level, but it does not apply to all HE. The quality assurance system covers at least one of the three elements:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - internal assessment - external review - publication of results
Orange (2)	<p>Legislation or regulations on quality assurance of programmes or institutions, including at least the first three elements, have been prepared but are not implemented yet</p> <p>OR</p> <p>implementation of legislation or regulations has begun on a very limited scale</p>
Red (1)	<p>No legislation or regulations on evaluation of programmes or institutions with at least the first three elements</p> <p>OR</p> <p>legislation in the process of preparation</p>

⁷ Higher education: all types of courses of study, or sets of courses of study, training or training for research at the post secondary level which are recognized by the relevant authorities of a Party as belonging to its higher education system.(definition from the Lisbon Recognition Convention)

6. Level of student and international participation⁸

QUALITY ASSURANCE	6a. Level of student participation
Green (5)	Students participate at four levels: - in the governance of national bodies for QA - in external review of HEIs and/or programmes: either in expert teams, as observers in expert teams or at decision making stage, - in consultation during external reviews -in internal evaluations
Light green (4)	Students participate at three of the four above levels
Yellow (3)	Students participate at two of the four above levels
Orange (2)	Students participate at one of the four above levels
Red (1)	There is no student involvement OR No clarity about structures and arrangements for student participation

6b. Level of international participation

QUALITY ASSURANCE	6b. Level of international participation
Green (5)	International participation takes place at four levels: - in the governance of national bodies for QA - in the external evaluation of national QA agencies, - as members or observers within teams for external review of HEIs and/or programmes - membership of ENQA or other international networks
Light green (4)	International participation takes place at three of the four above levels
Yellow (3)	International participation takes place at two of the four above levels
Orange (2)	International participation takes place at one of the four above levels
Red (1)	There is no international involvement OR No clarity about structures and arrangements for international participation

⁸ The indicator reflecting student and international participation (Indicator 6) has been split in two to make it easier to compute the scores, but it will appear as one score in the scorecard, with the possibility of further comments on the two issues separately in the textual part of the report

SCORECARD CRITERIA FOR RECOGNITION OF DEGREES AND STUDY PERIODS

7. Stage of implementation of diploma supplement

RECOGNITION	7. Stage of implementation of diploma supplement
Green (5)	<p>Every student graduating in 2007 will receive a Diploma Supplement in the EU/CoE/UNESCO Diploma Supplement format⁹ and in a widely spoken European language</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - automatically - free of charge
Light green (4)	<p>Every student graduating in 2007 will receive the Diploma Supplement in the EU/CoE/UNESCO Diploma Supplement format and in a widely spoken European language</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - on request - free of charge
Yellow (3)	<p>A DS in the EU/CoE/UNESCO Diploma Supplement format and in a widely spoken European language will be issued to some students OR in some programmes in 2007</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - on request - free of charge
Orange (2)	<p>A DS in the EU/CoE/UNESCO Diploma Supplement format and in a widely spoken European language will be issued to some students OR in some programmes in 2007</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - on request - not free of charge
Red (1)	<p>Systematic issuing of DS in the EU/CoE/UNESCO Diploma Supplement format and in a widely spoken European language has not started</p>

⁹ EU/CoE/UNESCO Diploma Supplement format and its explanatory note can be found at http://www.aic.lv/ace/ace_disk/Dipl_Sup/index.htm

8. National implementation of the principles of the Lisbon Recognition Convention

<p>RECOGNITION</p> <p>Green (5)</p>	<p>8. National Implementation of the principles of the Lisbon Recognition Convention</p> <p>The Convention has been ratified and appropriate legislation complies with the legal framework of the Lisbon Convention and the later Supplementary Documents¹⁰ have been adopted in appropriate legislation and applied in practice, so that the five main principles are fulfilled and:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - applicants have a right to fair assessment, - there is recognition if no substantial differences can be proven, - in cases of negative decisions the competent recognition authority demonstrates the existence of (a) substantial difference(s) - the country ensures that information on its institutions and their programmes is provided - an ENIC has been established
<p>Light green (4)</p>	<p>The Convention has been ratified and appropriate legislation complies with the legal framework of the Lisbon Convention and the later Supplementary Documents have been adopted in appropriate legislation, but some amendments are needed to apply in practice the principles of the Supplementary Documents.</p>
<p>Yellow(3)</p>	<p>The Convention has been ratified and appropriate legislation complies with three or four of the five abovementioned principles of the Lisbon Recognition Convention.</p>
<p>Orange (2)</p>	<p>The Convention has been ratified and appropriate legislation complies with one or two of the five abovementioned principles of the Lisbon Recognition Convention.</p>
<p>Red (1)</p>	<p>The Convention has been ratified but appropriate legislation has NOT been reviewed against the legal framework of the Lisbon Convention or the Supplementary Documents.</p> <p style="text-align: center;">OR</p> <p>Convention has not been ratified</p>

¹⁰ Recommendation on the Criteria and Procedures for Recognition (2001), Recommendation on the Recognition of Joint Degrees (2004), Code of Good Practice in the Provision of Transnational Education (2001) http://www.enic-naric.net/instruments.asp?display=legal_framework

9. Stage of implementation of ECTS

RECOGNITION	9. Stage of implementation of ECTS
Green (5)	In 2007 ECTS credits are allocated in all first and second cycle programmes, enabling credit transfer and accumulation.
Light green (4)	In 2007 credits are allocated in at least 75 per cent of the first and second cycle Higher Education programmes, using ECTS OR a fully compatible credit system enabling credit transfer and accumulation ¹¹
Yellow(3)	In 2007 credits are allocated in 50-74 per cent of Higher Education programmes, using ECTS or a fully compatible national credit system enabling credit transfer and accumulation
Orange (2)	In 2007: ECTS credits are allocated in less than 50 per cent of Higher Education programmes OR A national credit system is used which is not fully compatible with ECTS OR ECTS is used in all programmes but only for credit transfer
Red (1)	No credit system is in place yet

¹¹ A “translation” between the national system and ECTS should be provided.

SCORECARD CRITERIA FOR LIFELONG LEARNING¹²

10. Recognition of prior learning

LIFELONG LEARNING	10. Recognition of prior learning
Green (5)	There are procedures/national guidelines or policy for assessment of prior learning as a basis for 1) access to higher education programmes, and 2) allocation of credits towards a qualification and/or exemption from some programme requirements
Light green (4)	There are procedures/national guidelines or policy for assessment of prior learning but they are used for only one of the abovementioned purposes
Yellow (3)	Procedures/national guidelines or policy establishing for assessment of prior learning have been agreed or adopted and are awaiting implementation OR There are no specific procedures/national guidelines or policy for assessment of prior learning, but procedures for recognition of prior learning are demonstrably in operation at some higher education institutions or study programmes
Orange (2)	Implementation of recognition of prior learning is in a pilot phase at some higher education institutions OR Work at drawing up procedures/national guidelines or policy for recognition of prior learning has started
Red (1)	No procedures for recognition of prior learning are in place EITHER at the national OR at the institutional/programme level.

¹² The establishment of flexible learning paths will be reflected in the text of the Stocktaking report based on National Reports

SCORECARD CRITERIA FOR JOINT DEGREES

11. Establishment and recognition of joint degrees

Joint degrees	11. Establishment and recognition of joint degrees
Green (5)	Legislation allows and encourages establishing joint programmes and joint degrees. A number of HEIs have already established joint programmes and are awarding nationally recognised degrees jointly ¹³ with HEIs of other countries at all levels.
Light green (4)	There are no legal or other obstacles to establishing joint programmes and the awarding and recognition of joint degrees or at least double or multiple degrees ¹⁴ , but legislation does not specifically refer to joint degrees. OR Legislation for establishing joint programmes, awarding and recognition of joint degrees has been prepared and agreed, but not yet implemented.
Yellow (3)	There are no legal or other obstacles to establishing joint programmes with HEIs of other countries, but a degree is awarded in only one country after completion of the joint programme.
Orange (2)	There are obstacles to establishing joint programmes, awarding or recognizing joint degrees, but legislation or regulations are being drafted.
Red (1)	There are no possibilities to establish joint programmes, award and recognize joint degrees under current legislation and there are no plans to change this situation

¹³ Awarding degrees jointly here will be understood as a “real” joint degree, i.e. a degree awarded by at least two higher education institutions together with one joint degree certificate issued and where this certificate is valid without being supplemented with any single national degrees

¹⁴ A double or multiple degree is defined as two or more diplomas issued by two or more higher education institutions involved in an integrated study programme